

39 Store Street · London · WCM

Canada that we (est. 1933) have no connection with the firm  
which established itself in New York in 1962 under the same name.

**JUVENILES :** General Literature, Old Novels. History and most other Subjects. Catalogues issued.

**JABEZ ELLIOTT'S MISCELLAN**  
of old, rare, and unusual books, cur  
ous manuscripts, and ephemera.  
Issued every three weeks by  
Jabez Elliott, Ringwood, Hants.

© TIMES NEWSPAPERS  
LIMITED, 1967  
Printed and Published by Times Newspapers  
Limited at Printing House Square, in the City  
of St. Andrew by the Wardrobe, with St.  
Blackburn, in the City of London, E.C.4, Eng.  
Thursday, July 27, 1967

**BOOKBINDERS**  
CRAFT AND TRADE  
Work carried out to  
individual requirements  
**A. & M. WINSTANLEY**  
Devizes Road, Salisbury, Wilts.

**A. R. HEATH,**  
Antiquarian Bookseller  
15 Badminton Road, Cowmnd, Br  
**BOOKS OF THE 16th-18th CENTURY**  
rarer and/or interesting books of the  
century, is the theme of our regular cat  
Yolke inclusion on our mailing list is we  
**LIBRARIES PURCHASED.**  
Distance no obsta

**AFRICA-ASIA-RUSSIA**  
We buy books, pamphlets, review copies in any language. Any quantity collected. 876-7254  
**HAMMERSMITH BOOKS**  
110 Lords Wien, Gurnee, S.W. 13

**rare books**  
BOUGHT AND SOLD  
**THE TIMES BOOKS**  
Wilmote Street, London W

Selected Paperbacks

historical event, and interests have been many passions are century is a short which to place it in

There are so many  
things, and so  
many, half a  
century of time in  
perspective.

more than one political  
historical fantasy, V  
er's favour—and his o  
and by 1914 much of  
gone out of his politi  
ity of the land-own

industrialization even  
in spite of its immen-  
se material cost, it is a  
"other course" which  
have raised Russia;  
people, to their p

... look: and, human and...  
... to see any...  
... so rapidly...  
... the Russian...  
... levels of...

# VOT

## REDOUBT

Mavor's prose is rich  
as in the most liberal s

**Hutchinson**

**ANTHONY ANDREWES**  
Wykeham Professor of Ancient  
History in the University of Oxford

'It would be hard to imagine a more comprehensive and readable modern account of subject... sober, accurate and dependable. It is also a remarkable act of creative evocation, which will stand unchallenged for many years.'

*The Times Lit.*

**GEORGES FRIEDMANN**

'... It is a tribute to his profound analysis of the Jewish condition that almost nothing in it has been invalidated by events. As an examination of the problems of Israel alone, Mr. Friedmann's book would be of outstanding value, a handbook as well as a study. But the author returns constantly to deeper themes.'

'... Invaluable ... it ought compulsory reading for any interested in Middle Eastern affairs'

## Elizabeth Mavor

**THE REDOUBT**  
Miss Mavor's prose is rich, sensuous in the most literal. It powerfully evokes sound, smell, touch, sight, taste . . . and is superbly handled and brilliant.

**'highly sensitive, searching  
imaginative'**  
FRANK MCQUINN in *The*

**W. H.**

...geometrically very funny, the farce being sustained, inventive and never forced."

RICHARD BOSTON in *The*  
...deliciously funny."

## Hutchinson

**SECRET**

Press. 21s.



# CHOOSING NOT TO GO TO WAR

DAVID BOULTON: *Objection Overruled*. 319pp. MacGibbon and Kee. £2 5s.  
The *Pacifist Conscience*. Edited by Peter Mayer. 477pp. Rupert Hart-Davis. £2 2s.

There is one man whom all governments, quail before," the Duke of Northumberland told the House of Lords in 1904. "It is the conscientious objector no matter what government it may be that is in the end the most powerful force in the world." He was speaking in a debate on the Government's proposals for the introduction of compulsory military training. On this occasion their opponents rejected the principle of conscription for the army. Seven years later, in January, 1916, a Bill for the introduction of conscription was passed by the Commons and the Lords. It was an overwhelming majority and for the first time a British government had to face the problem of the conscientious objector to military service. In practice, the Duke of Northumberland was proved wrong: neither Asquith's Coalition government with its residue of pacifist sympathies nor its successor under Lloyd George showed any inclination to regard before the conscientious objector, with characteristic egotism, because their activities were a major embarrassment to the authorities, but for Cabinet ministers and government officials struggling with the problems of military and economic organization, the con-

scientious objectors were only a minor irritant. The national treatment of conscientious objectors to military service depends upon the existence of a sophisticated and comprehensive control of the nation's manpower. In the Second World War such a control enabled the Government not only to avoid a heart-on-heart clash with conscience but also to use the talents of many individual objectors in the nation's interests. In 1916 there was no Ministry of Labour and National Service and the machinery for mobilizing manpower was primitive and inexperienced. In addition, the conscience clause in the first Military Service Act was badly drafted: the intentions of Parliament were frequently misunderstood by the tribunals and the law made no provision for those men who refused to accept the tribunal's decision. Muddle and inexperience rather than deliberate persecution led to the arrest of some 10,000 men who professed to be conscientious objectors. Under the Act these men were "deemed to have been enlisted" and were handed over to the military authorities. In the army and later in prison a few conscientious objectors were subjected to unauthorised punishments or spontaneous bullying; many others suffered to a greater or lesser degree from military and penal sanctions that had been designed to deal with a very different type of prisoner. At the time it was not easy to distinguish bona fide complaints of ill-treatment from "atrocity stories" that provided effective propaganda against the authorities. After the war truth and fabrication merged to create a new legend in pacifist and socialist mythology, a legend whose martyrs were the victims of forcible feeding and Field Punishment No. 1, whose heroes were soldiers and conscientious objectors and whose comic relief was the prison chaplain wrestling with parishioners of unfamiliar intelligence.

No official account of this aspect of the history of the First World War has been published. As a result the government's case and that of the military and civil authorities have gone by default. The conscientious objectors and their friends have been less reticent. In 1922, John William Graham published the first full-length account which he called *Conscription and Conscience* and dedicated it to "the young men who in the dark days of the war kept the faith". His book has since been regarded as authoritative not only by his fellow Quakers but also by serious historians; A. J. P. Taylor cites Graham as the source of material on the treatment of conscientious objectors in his *English History 1914-45*.

John Graham was not a conscientious objector but he had been closely associated with Quaker and pacifist activity during the war and had attended numerous tribunal hearings. His book is one-sided and on some important points inaccurate. But Graham at least had the excuse that he was writing soon after the events: wounds were still open, official documents still closed. Now, forty-five years later, David Boulton has written another account of these complex and misunderstood events. If we expect an account that is balanced where Graham's was *partial*, and based on official records where Graham had to rely on hearsay and memories, we shall be disappointed. What he has given us is a re-hash of Graham's material, attractively produced and with four introductory chapters analysing the forces for and against conscription. These introductory chapters are informative and help to place the main events in their historical context; but in his account of the events themselves Mr. Boulton has contributed nothing of significance that is new and has perpetuated some of Graham's inaccuracies.

The local tribunals were asked to perform a task for which they were unsuited. The tribunal members were for the most part local coun-

## HOW AFRICA WORKS

JEN MEYNAUD and ANISSE SALAH-BEY: *Trade Unionism in Africa*. Translated by Angela Brech. 264pp. Methuen. £3 3s.  
R. C. ROBERTS and L. GREYTTIE DE BELLECOMBE: *Collective Bargaining in African Countries*. 158pp. Studies and Macmillan. 36s.

Most books on labour in developing countries either deal with the politics of trade unions or try to piece together the law and organization of industrial relations. Both these books of literature. Like most other published studies they cover, an entire country, but their perspective is limited by the subject-discipline of the authors, and their evidence consists of summaries of such original researches as exist, struggle together with the theory of the industrial relations and personal observation. A book like *Trade Unionism in Africa* is likely to be more successful at this than a political reference-point. The authors can be measured by the accuracy of their political analysis, and the quality of their research. Jen Meynaud and Anisse Salah-Bey are both experienced industrial relations and international organizational and political in his emphasis, it can be said that the book is a comparative study of some sophistication. Thus the limits of their material provide a lucid, if schematic, survey of the origins and political context of African unions, and, for English-speaking readers, a valuable summary of the situation in North Africa. They actually trace the problems of the emergence of trade unions and of the conflict between European models and African conditions. And yet the more one reads, the greater is the feeling that perhaps the book is not the kind of operational research that is a very complex, progressive. By discussing trade unions, the emphasis is inevitably on the attempts of elites to manipulate workers. In itself this is an interesting study, but it lacks the context of the industrial, rural and urban situation. They frequently identify with the workers, but they pay their dues, and they are not a party and industrial behaviour. But these are more the observations for understanding the foreign policy of the African labour movement, and the social structure which all this is briefly noted.

But these are more the observations for understanding the foreign policy of the African labour movement, and the social structure which all this is briefly noted.

One of the weaknesses of Mr. Boulton's book is that he exaggerates the importance of socialism as a source of conscientious objection; pacifism is dismissed as a minority motive. Peter Mayer's selection *The Pacifist Conscience* may be read as a useful corrective. Mr. Mayer has collected a number of the most interesting historical documents of the theory and practice of pacifism and non-resistance. These documents tell us more about the true nature of conscientious objection than the incidents described by Graham and Mr. Boulton. Yet one is left with the feeling that there is still more to know. Why, for example, are some conscientious objectors so aggressive? Perhaps it is for the psychiatrist and not the historian to provide an answer.

# How to criticise a book:

- Just say, "It is presented to us by a master, we can listen and will". (Spectator)
- Or, "Truth has won". (Sunday Times)
- Or, "It is a book like this that restores one's faith in Russian literature". (Times Literary Supplement)
- Or, "Significant far beyond its value as historical revelation". (The Times)
- But better still, "A superb book... notable for pathos, dignity, nobility". (Anthony Burgess)

BABIYAR is the book. Anatoly Kuznetsov the author. MacGibbon & Kee publish. And it's on sale now for 36/-.



Fathers and grandfathers were peasants, and whose great-grandfathers were serfs, operate, design and invent the most sophisticated modern machines. In the space of fifty years a primitive and backward people has been enabled to build up for itself a new kind of life and a new civilization. The magnitude, the extent and the speed of this advance are surely without parallel.

It would be wrong to pass over in silence—and Mr. Deutscher is not tempted to do so—the cost of this operation in human suffering, or the other ambiguous aspects. The most cruel burdens fell on the peasants who furnished the mass of the Russian population from the land, the reorganization of agriculture and the introduction of modern and large-scale methods of cultivation were a necessity if the country was to move forward and take its place in the modern world. The callousness and the brutalities with which the task was accomplished can be explained by the conditions in which it was undertaken—notably by the weakness of the regime in the countryside and the alienation of the peasant from it—but have left their stain on subsequent Soviet history. The spread of knowledge, enlightenment and scientific sophistication, though it has been, has taken place within a rigidly confined ideological framework, and to the accompaniment of a relentless persecution of heretical opinions; and, though similar symptoms have been present in some of the great intellectual movements of the past in the western world, the degree of intellectual regimentation in the Soviet Union—thanks in part to the scope and suddenness of the explosion, and in part to modern technical facilities—has been extraordinarily rigid and severe. The ambiguities of de-Stalinization have thrown the underlying struggle into sharp relief. It is significant, and perhaps encouraging, that the controversy about the necessary and permissible degree of intellectual freedom is today being carried on with a hitherto unusual frankness and publicity in Soviet journals.

Mr. Deutscher approaches tentatively and with some misgivings the

problem of the new groups of bureaucrats, technocrats, managers and top-ranking intellectuals, who have been popularized in some recent writings as a "new class"—a class living, in the Marxist sense, on the surplus value produced by the worker and constituting an exploiting class. The existence of these materially privileged strata in Soviet society is open and apparent. On the other hand, it does not seem that they are sufficiently homogeneous to have developed the close bonds of common interest and common outlook which are the essential basis of a "class", or that they have either the will or the capacity to act as a united pressure group in Soviet politics. Mr. Deutscher derives their peculiar quality, as a class and yet not a class, from two specific features. They enjoy privileges exclusively of respect of consumption and not of accumulation; they cannot acquire property in the means of production, and become capitalists in the Marxist sense. And it follows from this that the group does not and cannot consolidate itself. It has no inherited property, and is dissolved and re-formed from one generation to the next. As long as Soviet society retains its fluidity, it will remain revolutionary.

The same answer applies in part to the problem of equality in modern industrial society. Marx, who analysed the contemporary world through deeply absorbed Hegelian categories of thought, believed that what he called "abstract human labour" had been perverted by the division of labour, which was the characteristic tool of capitalism, into an object of exploitation. The division of labour was the fundamental evil; and it was only when this was overcome that the worker would emerge no longer as an object, but as an individual in his own right. This would in turn involve the disappearance of the distinction not only between the urban and the rural worker (the peasant was already a dying class under capitalism), but also between mental and physical labour, between brain and brawn. These conceptions were rooted in Marxist

thinking, and found their expression in Lenin's vision, in *State and Revolution*, of the now simplified tasks of administration performed by ordinary workers in rotation, and in early experiments, after the victory of the revolution, in workers' control over the factories.

Marx seems to have remained convinced that industrial and technological development would lead to a greater uniformity and not to a further diversification of labour; and a certain tendency can undoubtedly be found in modern conditions to offset or blur the line of demarcation between skilled and unskilled labour. But the main development in the most advanced modern industries has been to call for the creation of a large élite of managers, scientists and skilled technicians, far removed from the mass of relatively unskilled and unspecialized workers who will in any foreseeable future remain a numerical majority in the labour force. Lenin did not shrink from preaching when he came to consider the organization and functioning of the party; and after the revolution he found himself making eloquent pleas for "one-man management" in the factory.

In the 1930s Stalin imparted to his equal element of cynicism into his denunciation of "levelling" as a bourgeois prejudice. But he had put his finger on a real problem, and one by no means confined to the Soviet Union.

Revolutions do not easily live down the Utopian visions which have inspired them. Indeed it may be said that a society which has no Utopia to revisit is in a state of decay. But to peer into the future, as Marx knew, is a hazardous job; and it is easier to analyse the direction than to postulate the goal. Mr. Deutscher has his Utopias for the Russian revolution. When he contemplates the Utopia of Liberty, he is content to build it out of the bricks of the past. The Soviet Union, whose revolution contained bourgeois, as well as proletarian elements, has still to catch up with the old "bourgeois liberal programmes".

It needs to obtain control over its government and to transform the state into an instrument of the nation's democracy, in the first instance, to re-establish

## Mandeville's Travels

Edited by M. C. SEYMOUR

*Mandeville's Travels*, perhaps the most popular book of the later Middle Ages, remains its fascination today. Based on an exhaustive study of the manuscript, this edition presents the findings of modern scholarship which seeks to restore the book to its proper place in English literature. 55s net

## The Poems of Robert Southwell, S.J.

Edited by JAMES H. McDONALD and NANCY POLLARD BROWN

Southwell's poems in English were written during his work with the English Mission, from his return to England in July 1580 to his arrest in June 1592. The text is based on substantive editions, collated with the surviving manuscripts or, for poems not included in early editions, on the Stonyhurst College manuscript. *Frontispiece* 55s net

## Reason and Authority

The *Thought of William Chillingworth* ROBERT R. ORR

The author uses unpublished manuscript material to illuminate Chillingworth's conversion, first to the Roman Catholicism, then back to the Church of England. The book is both an intellectual biography and an essay in the history of ideas. 40s net

## Comecon

*Integration Problems of the Planned Economies* MICHAEL KASER

This new edition incorporates developments to the end of 1966. The narrative is related to the stages of hostility in the Sino-Soviet confrontation, and to collaboration of the now discredited centralized Soviet pattern. *Second edition* 55s net

## Rural Land Administration in New Zealand

Edited by I. BRUCE BROWN

In six papers delivered by experts in their own fields, the present scene is studied against a background of 125 years of land administration in New Zealand. 20s net

## Amos and Walton's Introduction to French Law

F. H. LAWSON, A. E. ANTON and L. NEVILLE BROWN

The book provides an introduction to French Civil and Commercial Law. This edition includes the radical changes introduced by the French Parliament in 1965 in the law governing Matrimonial Property Relations, as well as other developments in French Law. *Third edition* 55s net

## The Power Structure

*Political Process in American Society* ARNOLD M. ROSE

This book gives a comprehensive picture of how political power is structured and developed and how it is utilized in social action. The scope of the subject matter is broad enough to allow the book to be used as a text in political sociology. 60s net (paper covers 19s net) - Paper edition, Galaxy Books

## The Mammals of Eastern Canada

RANDOLPH L. PETERSON

A reference book for everyone interested in Canadian natural history as well as for students of zoology and mammalogy. It gives the life history, habitat and habits of all mammals, land and marine, that have appeared in recent times within eastern Canada. 8 colour plates, 231 line drawings, 107 distribution maps. 45s net

## Wildlife Heritage of South Africa

DOUGLAS HEY

It is not only an authoritative account, by a Director of Nature Conservation, of the plants and animals of the country, but also a useful introduction to the conservation and wildlife management problems. Attractively illustrated, it gives helpful references for further reading. *COUNTRYMAN* *Nature's Heritage* 90s net

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

Then, in the middle 1920s, Stalin and Bukharin, with Trotsky, Kamenev and Zinoviev in opposition, propounded the famous doctrine of socialism in one country. This led to the identification of the interests of socialism with Russian national interest. In the pursuit of national security, Stalin soft-pedalled the cause of the socialist revolution elsewhere, muzzled and eventually dissolved the Comintern, and did his misbegotten best to insulate his country from involvement in foreign conflicts. Hence the refusal to allow German communists to collaborate with the Social-Democratic Party in resisting the rise of Hitler; hence the Soviet-German pact of 1939, the acceptance in 1945 of the partition of Europe into zones of influence, and the failure to support the Chinese communists against Chiang Kai-shek down to the very moment when they proved victorious by their own exertions. All these were disastrous instances of the subordination of the interests of socialism and world revolution to a narrowly conceived Realpolitik. It is not surprising that the socialists of other countries have by and large turned against the U.S.S.R.

The picture is correct so far as it goes. But it perhaps fails to do justice to a dilemma which the makers of Soviet foreign policy have faced from the beginning, and still face today. Lenin, at the time of Brest-Litovsk, had to meet a charge from his more idealistic followers of sacrificing the true socialist cause by seeking an accommodation with an imperialist power, and defended himself on the ground of the need to preserve the socialist revolution in the one country where it had been achieved. In the trade agreement with Great Britain in 1921, and at the Genoa conference, in the following year, Lenin showed himself willing to seek peaceful coexistence with the western powers through an implied or explicit promise to call off Soviet propaganda for world revolution. It is true that, where Lenin had merely landed a little to one side of the fence, Stalin came down with a sledgehammer. But the fence was there, and it was impossible to sit on it indefinitely. Stalin might have argued that Lenin had at least pointed in that direction.

The story of the 1930s is inevitably told nowadays with the hindsight of 1939 and after. Mr. Deutscher notes with some apparent surprise that, in spite of de-Stalinization, the Soviet-German pact has never been held up to approbrium. The reason seems clear. Nothing could be easier than to condemn Stalin for concluding the pact. But on what grounds would



## WHO FOLLOWS WHOM

Art of Our Time. Edited by Will Grohmann. 509pp. Thames and Hudson. £4.4s.

This anthology of supposedly explanatory essays, planned and assembled by Professor Grohmann, an osteographer, purports to offer the reader an intelligent account of what has been going on in "Painting and Sculpture throughout the World" between about 1955 and the present. Dr. Grohmann has been one of the most active jurors of international exhibitions in the post-war years, but now he has called to "the younger generation of art critics" to write this book around him, and he wearily admits in a foreword that he no longer knows what standards to apply in judging modern art.

At any international show, the jury is faced with the all but unanswerable question of who is to be invited and who is to get the prizes. The number of young artists has become virtually infinite; the concept of art has expanded beyond all measure, and yet any interference by a jury is regarded as untimely. Everything is art, from works in a legitimate tradition to the most daring experiments with light projections or staggardly ordered ensembles, and we do not have far to go to the time when mere indications will be given instead of worked-out sketches, indications for a public, whatever its reactions might be.

It seems not to occur to Dr. Grohmann that the responsibility for this present-day state of utter confusion and seemingly unchallengeable rights may lie in the attitude of *laissez faire* adopted since the war by representatives of the international (and national) art "establishments" who have arranged the shows and handed out the money. Had those who presume to "judge" and to write about contemporary art concentrated more on critical standards than on remaining professional avant-gardists, we might be in less of a mess today. It is not difficult to establish a valid distinction between works of art and works of decoration, just as good art can be distinguished from bad. Yet because it is thought illiberal, reactionary and unfashionable nowadays to be selective, everything and anything is quite unjustifiably accepted as a work of art, and as painting and sculpture. There may be art in craftsmanship,

but neither the crafts nor the sciences produce works of art. By no standards should it ever have been possible for anyone to consider "during experiments with light projections", for example, as works of art, any more than the home carpentry of Louise Nevelson, the nonsense machines of Tinguely, the "Aunt Sally" of Marisol, the Tassardesque *tableaux* of Segal, the painted puppets of Minujin, or the wire langles of Kramer should be allowed within the category of either painting or sculpture. They may fall into such categories as decorative art, expensive toys, electrical experiment, fun and games in the home, or whatever. They may be very clever and well made, but works of art they are not. And it is a betrayal of all serious art to put them on the same level.

One of the great sources of weakness of the volume under review is that it has been born of intellectual and aesthetic confusion. Another source of weakness derives from the belief that art, like Esperanto, can be worthwhile when it tries to become a universal language. The basic principle of Esperanto is to make communication possible between human beings by finding the lowest common denominator between a great many vocal sounds having a similar meaning. This is the exact opposite of the spiritual process by which any worthwhile art has ever been produced. The fact that artists in Greece, Israel or Peru are now making imitations of Matisse, Mondrian, Dubuffet or Bacon, that someone in Yugoslavia is imitating Vasarely, or that in 1960 a female painter in Argentina "advised her compatriots to do a period of compulsory military service in Cubism"—whatever that may mean fifty years later!—does not in itself make the contemporary art produced in those countries either significant, good or universally interesting. Would a reasonable person see any merit in a poor imitation of a Balenciaga model made by a dressmaker in, say, Mozambique ten years later? Yet that is the equivalent of the standard by which this volume has been put together. Little attention is paid to the human significance, or human content, of the works involved. What matters most is who is following who, and which is the art capital of the world—as though anyone cared.

The fact that the (unimportant) Unesco Prize was awarded in 1960 to a Greek artist by an international jury at the Venice Biennale spurs Mr. Dimitris A. Fatouros on to claim

that "Greek art is undoubtedly on the upgrade today". Mr. Alan Bowness, closing his eyes to wars, famine and assassinations, asserts that it is "impossible to pretend that the world is not a much sadder place" in the 1960s than ever before and exalts the merits of paintings for which he cannot claim more than that they are "allegories of visual understanding, asking questions about the semantics of art". Since when must we look upon books of grammar or anatomical text-books as oceanic and serious works of literature? All this is highly unreal and superficial. Nowhere in this volume is the important late work of Picasso and Braque so much as dismissed, yet the "Studios" of the latter and the "Dejeuners" of the former are artistically of far greater human and artistic significance than anything that is included. Marcel Duchamp figures largely; but then his is today a fashionable name to throw around, even though he has produced nothing for forty years. It is also strange that a volume which purports on its title-page to cover "Painting and Sculpture throughout the world" and which takes in Poland, Yugoslavia, Venezuela and Finland does not go into the art being produced in Russia, Canada or any of the Arab countries. For those who want long lists of names and dates, woven into a tangle of jargon, superficialities, pious hopes and market-gossip, this unwieldy book will no doubt fill a need. But they must be prepared to put up with this kind of thing:

Each time that one finds himself in the presence of a painting by Jean Dewasne, one is arrested by a physical presence that extends Mondrian's philosophical vision into the perspective of delirium that of an exacerbated sensitivity that turns away from nostalgia to affirm a violent and systematic love of modern life. But what is modern life? According to Pluqueras, a compartmentalization of contradictions. According to Dewasne "a humanity of prodigious possibilities".

"The World", apart from those vast areas not covered, has been parcelled out by the editor or sixteen lists, each of which gets an essay. If every contributor had kept his summary as brief and as much to the point as Yvonne Fischer writing on Israel Art, the volume would have been more realistic and critically superior. It is most elaborately illustrated with 334 plates in black and white, and 128 in colour. This should facilitate the choice and prize band-out for any forthcoming biennale.

## BLACK BEAUTY

MICHEL LEIRIS and JACQUELINE DELANGE: *Afrique noire: In création plastique*. 450pp. Paris: Gallimard. 120 fr.FRANK WILLET: *Life in the History of West African Sculpture*. 232pp. Thames and Hudson. £4.4s.

*Afrique noire: In création plastique* by Michel Leiris and Jacqueline Delange is a very pleasant surprise. Visually, this is by far the most attractive book on African art to have appeared so far. Instead of giving us a sort of over-ill, sickly photographed museum piece, the book places African art in its context. In addition to actual carvings, brass figures, masks, stone or mud sculptures, we are introduced to architecture, mural painting, landscape, ritual, people, hair-styles and body painting. Instead of the refined and academic dignity of most books on the subject, we are here being plunged into a kind of total visual experience of Africa.

The text is quite lively up to the same standard. The subject is of course worked out. Even a scholar of the magnitude of Michel Leiris cannot change the fact that the time for generalizations on African art has passed. We are beginning to know too much about some of these cultures and what is really needed now are detailed monographs on more specialized subjects. For discussion of African art, it is nevertheless fascinating, particularly this book's analysis of the "preliminary" meaning of the word used for beauty in many African languages. Jacqueline Delange has supplied the book with a useful survey of the different uses and their art-forms as well as a very full bibliography.

Frank Willet's book *Life in the History of West African Sculpture* is much more the kind of book we need. It is a detailed and readable African

## CZECH COMPOSERS

JAMIL BURGHAEUSER: *Not only Mountains*. Prague: Panton (Publishers of the Union of Czechoslovak Composers). 9.50 Kcs.

In Czechoslovakia the common man has been progressively alienated from his country's great composers by a monumental facade of hero-worship. Smetana suffered most in this way because he became the victim of a cult of which Zdeněk Nejedlý was arch-priest and which, if it had been continued, might have succeeded in killing him for successive generations. In the feud between the supporters of Smetana and Dvořák, Nejedlý identified himself passionately with the former and, when he finally emerged triumphant as the Czechoslovak Minister of Culture after the war, many of Dvořák's supporters, including his greatest interpreter Václav Talich, found themselves set on one side.

An attempt to scale down in life size the greatest Czech composers has now been undertaken by a leading Dvořák scholar and composer, Jamil Burghaeuser, who has continued the work of his father-in-law, the eminent Dvořák scholar, Otakar Šoněk, and is himself the author of a valuable *Thematic Catalogue* of Dvořák's works which every lover of that composer should possess.

The three Czech composers chosen are Smetana, Dvořák and Fibich. Mr. Burghaeuser justifies his exclusion of Janáček on the ground that he is really a twentieth-century composer, while the others belong to the nineteenth. The idea of bringing together three composers who were contemporaries but of differing age groups, and of tabulating their individual characteristics, from their appearance and habits to the state of their bank balances, is rewarding, even if some details appear trivial (like their favourite dishes).

It always seemed that Dvořák was a small stocky figure of a man but surprisingly he was much the taller of the three, measuring nearly five foot ten inches. Most students of Czech music know that Smetana was lively and temperamental, whereas Dvořák was quiet, withdrawn and suspicious, but they might not know that Smetana in his youth was a successful mimic and extrovert, whereas Dvořák's monosyllabic, aphoristic conversation made him appear odd in society. Smetana loved dancing and playing all kinds of card games, whereas Dvořák's hobbies were pigeons, gardening and railway engines.

Concern with personal idiosyncrasies of the composers should not be allowed to obscure the valuable musical criticism which this book contains. Indeed one of its best features is Mr. Burghaeuser's masterly summary of the musical development of all three composers, expounded composition by composition.

It is, of course, the third composer on whom our interest centres: Zdeněk Fibich is little known outside Bohemia but is much esteemed here, although he never achieved the immense status and popularity of Dvořák and Smetana. He wrote a number of successful operas which are still in the Prague National Theatre repertoire, including *The*

*Assays on Music*. Edited by Felix Aprahamian. 260pp. Cassell. 10s.

Musical history, appreciation and criticism are congruent and convergent studies and have even become disciplines in musical education. The weekly essays which *The Listener* has always published have had an educational intention as complements to the B.B.C.'s output of music, which in the course of forty years has extended the musical franchise to all the population who desire to exercise it. They have tended to be essays in appreciation of the music since they were designed to be read before specific performances, and criticism *post eventum* had another column provided for it. But the line cannot be rigidly drawn and the fifty-five articles here reprinted cross and re-cross it. The opening essay by E. M. Forster on "Not Listening to Music" hardly goes into either of the categories but is simply a delightful essay about music in which the author confesses to inattentive day-dreaming or "wolf-gathering" as he calls it. This is only moderately reprehensible, for music as Plato says has a way of getting at the subconscious and imposing good order on it.

But in the main these are learned

## Fiction

## BLEEDING HEARTS

CHRISTINA STEAD: *Colters' England*. 352pp. Secker and Warburg. 35s. For *Love Alone*. 502pp. Angus and Robertson. 32s. 6d.

Christina Stead has been writing novels at regular, if not frequent, intervals since the 1930s. *For Love Alone* was first published in 1944 and has been reprinted recently. It is a long but not verbose study of an Australian girl's obsession for a graduate student whom she follows all the way to London. The same concentration on a central theme and a similar interest in people's emotional attitudes to *Colters' England*, which came out last year in America and now makes its debut here.

Where *For Love Alone* is flawed by a somewhat obvious plot and a sentimental approach, *Colters' England* has an interestingly different kind of heroine and a much tougher stance. "And so you dabble in their lives as if their lives were puddles, just to cool off your emotions a bit, Nell," is how the behaviour of the heroine, Nell Cook (née Colter), is summed up to her by her brother Tom. He could not have described her activities better. Nell works guardedly on a left-wing paper while her husband George wanders abroad in supra-national organizations like the I.L.O. She lives in a seamy East End house which she fills with women she collects and

binds to her with a choking intensity. "I want them to come to me and learn, come to me," she tells Tom. "I can teach them that there is only one way, and they must find it in pain, but I can help," and she shakes off his accusation that "if you inter-specied with them for a hundred years you'd never know anything about them".

The background to the Colters, the place where Nell began her pattern of lurid rhetoric, misplaced idealism and total meddling, is depressed Bridgehead, and we return there for horrifying glimpses (these are some of the best scenes in the book) of a

senile mother, a pathetic old uncle and a distraught spinster sister.

But the spine of the book is Nell's. The different episodes and characters, which trip off Christina Stead's pen so readily as endearments like "chick" and "pet," run from Nell's tongue, are there only to enhance her presence. She is an extraordinary creation, a paranoid vampire with a heart of gold and though the details about her are often slightly ridiculous and somehow unconvincing—her asphyxiating cough and delirious with her editor about the essential truths blue-pencilled from her copy—she is convincingly alive. She carries the book.

## LOOSE UPPER LIP

ROBIN COOK: *Public Purity and Private Places*. 208pp. Hutchinson. 25s.

Mr. Cook is keeping up his crusade against the English upper middle classes. In *The Legacy of the Stiff Upper Lip*, old Etonians were held responsible for the poverty in Extremadura, Spain. In his new book, set in London and Sussex, the upper middle class is more resolutely on the decline, and even less convincing as a serious threat to Mr. Cook's well-meant liberalism. The trouble is that the characters he selects to represent the middle classes are hardly repre-

sentative: an old man numbed after a stroke, a middle-aged homosexual who sells dirty pictures in Soho, an ex-bed who poses for them with filthy lorry-drivers. Mr. Cook lays in to his puny targets with vigorous aggression, and can now and then be funny. His eye for the paraphernalia of class ritual is certainly competent, and the dialogue and manners are authentic enough: the novel just about passes as mild, though inconsequential entertainment.

## BACK TO THE LAND

E. DE QUEIROZ: *The City and the Mountains*. Translated from the Portuguese by Roy Campbell. 217pp. Athens: Ohio University Press. \$4.50.

translation of this novel is not likely to enhance de Queiroz's spreading reputation. Behind the English words a certain cool stylistic wit in the original can be perceived, but in Roy Campbell's heroic attempt to keep a flavour of Portuguese idiom without straining, Italian *facile* falls to work directly.

Fibich fell from grace at the end of his career by deserting his native land for Germany, and becoming infatuated with a certain cool stylistic wit in the original can be perceived, but in Roy Campbell's heroic attempt to keep a flavour of Portuguese idiom without straining, Italian *facile* falls to work directly.

And visit to the estates in Portugal which his wealth derives is completely undertaken by Jacinto after some absurd over-preparation, but even the total attention of the world cannot prevent rail-

ways from losing his precious baggage, and the prince finds himself forced to taste peasant and squirearchical life without the protection of his costly Parisian veneer. Of course, it improves his health, un-jinches his palate, restores his nerve, provides him with an unsophisticated wife, and secures his happy future. A simple

structure, and de Queiroz's main interest seems to have been to exercise his virtuosity.

A university press should surely have realized that many readers would like to be told the year in which the novel was written and, in this particular case, the year in which Campbell completed his translation.

## GONE TO POT

OLIVIERO CIGADA: *Nel paese dei Baraburri*. 133pp. Milan: Sugarco. L.1,000.

This is a very witty and macabre satire on a post-colonial African state. It would cause the deepest offence to native Africans, were they able to read Italian—but as the European languages they know are mainly English or French they are unlikely to pick it out. A mission of Italian "economic operatives" is sent to the country of the Baraburri. There is complete misunderstanding between the local natives, who are at a very early stage of evolution, and the members of the "mission". Eventually all the members of the "mission", except for the narrator, are killed and

eat. We are, of course, reminded of pre-war Evelyn Waugh, and as a satirist, Signor Cigada can almost stand up to the comparison.

The trouble is that the target is very easy one to hit. Signor Cigada is Milanese—that is to say, he was born into one of the most industrially sophisticated centres in the world. One would have liked him to show some mercy and a deeper awareness of the problem of developed and undeveloped countries on whose coexistence the future of mankind depends. He is still under thirty and his talent is obvious. As he gets older he may get more charitable.

## MINDING HIS PS

AXEL JENSEN: *Epp*. Translated from the Norwegian by Oliver Stallybrass. 116pp. Chatto and Windus. 15s.

Few serious writers have succeeded in exploiting the science fiction idiom satisfactorily, but Axel Jensen's *Epp* is an unqualified success. A paternalistic but pleasant home for old people provides him with a perfect setting for this perceptive, cool, and witty novel.

Epp is a retired wallpaper hanger at a society where class is denoted by the number of letters comprising his name. Epp occasionally shares his hope that the young nephew Epp, after the back of Eppen seems high to hope for—though Epp would be a terrible dis-

insect-eating pol-plant, or the exact boiling of his daily egg—content Epp's narrow mind. His neighbour Lem, who madly wishes to break down the barriers between the pensioners and establish sociable community patters, arouses Epp's profound hostility, contempt, and fear.

## MONK BUSINESS

JOSEPH MARTINDALE: *Found Wanting*. 206pp. New Authors. 25s.

Mr. Martindale writes of the near two years spent by Brother Martin as a novice, aged about 17½ to begin with, in a monastic order. At an early stage of his seclusion Brother Martin finds in himself a streak of rebelliousness; an invincible reluctance to submerge his own personality. When, for example, Brother Albert bores his class during A-level English—Wordsworth's *Prelude*—Brother Martin cannot help showing he is bored and, what is worse, cannot help showing he resents it when he is reprimanded. If the fault lies with Brother Albert, Brother Martin has to say so. Brother Albert, of course, finds this deplorably unmonkish. So does the Abbot, and it is not long before Martin is expelled, with a testimonial that admits

he is intelligent and good at cricket. The description of monastic life is vivid, unemphatic and absorbing. The remoteness of that life—being only all of them be living in some large and lonely cave with St. Augustine of Hippo for their nearest neighbour—is well conveyed, so that it comes as a shock when the whole crew of them are packed into a coach and taken up to London to feast on the wonders of the Victoria and Albert Museum. This remoteness unfortunately brushes off on to the characterization. The insufferably holy Brother Benedict, for example, or the softly and endearing Brother Cuperloo—they are seen, somehow, at a distance, and when Mr. Martindale gives them anything to say, come to us from far away.

## Richard Jones

## The Age of Wonder

A brilliant first novel about an elderly widow, living in an unattractive Welsh limbo, who redeems a tricky financial situation by selling her last distinguished husband's memoirs. "Well-rounded novel of social nuance and family intrigue, a convincing picture of family relationships... the close feeling of prying eyes and petty animosities is well conveyed."—Sarah Curtis. The Times. 30s.

## Peter D. Arnott

## An Introduction to the Greek World

This lively and readable book provides the student and traveller with answers to everyday questions about Greek literature, history and civilization, ancient and modern. 8 pages of plates. 30s.

## Kylie Tennant

## Ma Jones and the Little White Cannibals

A brilliant and hilarious novel exposing the less wholesome pretensions of Australian society. It's a riot! 21s.

## Christopher Howard

## Splendid Isolation

This is the first comprehensive study of Britain's isolationist policy at the end of the 19th century. It shows why her international position was described as isolationist, and also how the connotation of splendour became attached to it. 30s.

## Pat Barr

## The Coming of the Barbarians

The remarkable story of the 'invasion' of Japan by Western traders during the 19th century. A careful, pleasantly written and, at times, exciting study of an important subject... an entertaining book, which, with its excellently selected photographs, is evocative of a colourful, long-departed period. —Ian Nish, New Society. 16 pages of plates. 37s. 6d.

## Stanley Eugene Fish

## Surprised by Sin

A study of *Paradise Lost*, in which Mr. Fish resolves the controversial points that have long divided critics of Milton's epic poem. Throughout he preserves the integrity of the poem as a Christian epic, while doing full justice to the richness of its texture. 42s.

## Simona Pakenham

## Sixty Miles from England

The extraordinary and colourful story of the English community in 19th century Chile. Simona Pakenham's book is completely delightful, written in a refreshingly straightforward manner. —Paul Bailey, The Observer. 36s.

## Elizabeth Wiskemann

## Undeclared War

Second Edition. *Undeclared War* was written under great pressure during the summer preceding Hitler's attack on Poland—the event that precipitated World War Two. This profoundly interesting book gives an eye-witness account of Nazi techniques and attitudes on the eve of war. 36s.

## E. R. Emmet

## 101 Brain Puzzlers

For the Young of all Ages. A compendium of original puzzles of varying types and difficulty, not requiring any specialized mathematical knowledge. There are fully explained solutions at the end of the book. 30s.

## John Buxton

## A Tradition of Poetry

A critical examination of eight 16th and 17th century poets (among them Wyatt, Earl of Surrey, Edmund Spenser) against the literary and social tradition of their time. 7 plates. 30s.

## Franklin B. Zimmerman

## Henry Purcell, 1659-1695

His Life and Times. "Musicians will certainly be grateful for the immense care with which Professor Zimmerman has compiled all the accurate information he can find." —Imogen Holst, Sunday Times. 24 plates. 70s.

## James A. Williamson &amp; Donald Southgate

## A Short History of British Expansion

Volume 2: The Modern Empire and Commonwealth. 1967. Now in its sixth edition. This standard handbook, in its subject, is concise, accurate, complete, excellent in arrangement, and written in a style of unpretentious dignity. —Journal of Education. 30s.

## J. T. Ward

## Sir James Graham A Biography

Graham was one of the most enigmatic figures of 19th century politics: a statesman of considerable ability, he was for a time First Lord of the Admiralty in the Whig Reform Cabinet, and later became Peel's right-hand man. This sensitive and informative biography tells us much not only about the man but about his age. —Ace Briggs, Yorkshire Post. 55s.

## A Notebook of Commonwealth History

Third edition of this invaluable work of reference. 42s. cloth. 21s. paper.

## J. H. Adler (Editor)

## Capital Movements

The collected papers of a conference (sponsored by the I.E.A.) that brought together scholars and government officials directly concerned with Capital Movements. This subject is discussed from three aspects—historical, monetary, and resources. The book is an up-to-the-minute account of the latest developments in this important field. 63s.

## Colin Clark

## Population Growth and Land Use

It seems almost superfluous to say that his extraordinary range and depth of scholarship will make it immediately a standard work on its subject. —Peter Hall, New Society. 70s.

MACMILLAN



## DISILLUSION IN THE MONSOON MUD

BERNARD B. FALL: *Hell in a Very Small Place. The Siege of Dien Bien Phu.* 515pp. Pall Mall Press. £2 15s.

When Colonel Jules Roy wrote his eloquent and moving *Battle of Dien Bien Phu* in 1963, it was said that the book came as near to the truth as would be possible until the secret archives were opened. Sufficient of those archives were made available to the late Professor Fall to enable him to write a substantially more complete account only three years later. He does not, as he says himself, close every information gap about the battle, but he tells the story blow by blow in as much detail as we are likely to need, objectively, and with a wealth of documentation. Some of his political conclusions will none the less long be debated. The book thus stands as a fitting memorial not only to the scholarship of Bernard Fall, but also to his passionate involvement in the problem which so tragically cost him his life six months ago.

The incredible politico-military blundering which underlay the Dien Bien Phu disaster is already well known. Professor Fall takes it a stage farther back than is customary. When the victory of Mao Tse-tung in China engaged the United States on the side of allies whose "colonialist" wars had not previously measured up to American moral standards, it became an understanding between the Allies in Korea that nobody would, unilaterally, make peace with a Communist enemy.

The *quid pro quo* of that agreement was that the French broke off negotiations under way with the Viet Minh, while the United States began to assume an ever increasing part of the financial burden of the Indo-China War.

In 1953, however, the United States unilaterally made peace in Korea. The record does not yet show whether France protested, but at least she felt free to make her own peace in Indo-China and promptly said that she would do so. There were therefore logical limits to the plan of campaign for the next two years which General Navarre, as the new commander in Indo-China, presented to Paris in July, 1953, although nobody appears to have been very clear about this.

The French will to peace was reinforced when in September a Vietnamese Congress in Saigon declared independence *outside* the French Union as the national aim. There could now be no certainty that even victory would preserve French interests in Indo-China; the reason for continuing the costly struggle had departed. This is, however, only half the story; as Victor Bator in *Vietnam: A Diplomatic Tragedy* has recently explained, a French victory, or at any rate the continuation

## NEW TOWNS OF THE MIDDLE AGES

MAURICE BERESFORD

## TOWN PLANTATION IN ENGLAND, WALES AND GASCONY

Professor Beresford shows how the English added to settlement in the Middle Ages by the deliberate creation of new towns in open countryside. A long gazetteer gives the basic historical and topographical facts for these New Towns. Specimen plans show what medieval planners thought a town should include, and photographs show typical surviving features. The book concerns hundreds of well-known towns and villages including Liverpool, Portsmouth and Salisbury. Photographs, line drawings and maps.

LUTTERWORTH PRESS / 4 BOUVERIE ST, E.C.4.

of the struggle against the Communists in Indo-China, was very much a United States interest now that the fighting had stopped in Korea. In his election campaign Eisenhower had undertaken to bring the boys home from Korea. Unlike the United States Navy and Air Force, the Army relied on conscripted manpower. "The boys" were thus electrically important. But on the other hand the new President had also sworn to roll back the tide elsewhere. For this he alone others had to be persuaded to fight. With his administration already under pressure for "appeasement" in Korea, Eisenhower accordingly sought to step up the pressure in Indo-China. In the very same month of September, when the French saw their reason for fighting disappear, they agreed to increase their efforts in return for more United States material and money.

With American advisers now in the field, American enthusiasm weighed more heavily, of course, on Navarre in Saigon than on the government in Paris. The loyalty of Laos to the French connexion, brought into contrast with the attitudes of Vietnam and Cambodia when Laos signed its treaty with France in October, also presented a problem; for it was soon clear that the Viet Minh intended a further massive invasion of the country during the coming dry weather. This could not be warded off by the limited operations to which Navarre was pledged.

From this double dilemma it came about that the relatively minor operation of occupying Dien Bien Phu as a raiding base in the Tongking uplands was transformed into the deliberate set-piece battle by which the French expected to crack the Viet Minh. The author shows us how this occurred and examines the disagreements and misunderstandings between the French military leaders which seriously affected their subsequent cooperation. Important disagreements were there, for if they had ended differently defeat might have been avoided. The essential was that times had changed. The end of the Korean fighting had freed Chinese material effort—if not volun- teers—for use in Indo-China, as had been foreseen. The French knew the large numbers of men whom the Viet Minh had available, but they had hitherto been able to counter superior numbers with their guns and air power. They assumed that they would do so again, that they could easily neutralize or destroy such field guns as the enemy could drag through the mountainous jungle to Dien Bien Phu, and that their air reinforcement and ground support operations would be immune

from interference. They counted without the anti-like devotion of the Viet Minh which set a mass of guns in invulnerable emplacements, and also without the moral effect of prolonged operations on their own troops, over a fifth of whom would break in action. In short, they fatally underestimated their enemy. The preparations were made—ill-made—in the confident anticipation of victory within days of the first Viet Minh assault, and on March 13, 1954, the battle started. In eight weeks of fire and heroism Dien Bien Phu held, starved and finally collapsed in monsoon mud. The disaster had the fascinating inevitability of a classical tragedy in which the hubris, the overweening arrogance, of the hero himself is the cause of his inescapable doom. Professor Fall's account illuminates the separate actions of the battle and also the battle as a whole. It is an indispensable source for students of military history and is likely to be the standard work for some time.

Even as the military scene was set, the French had thankfully agreed to discuss an Indo-Chinese political settlement at the conference on the Korean War which was to be held at Geneva in April, 1954. Navarre, in the delusion of victory, had encouraged his government to think that the military situation would significantly have improved by then. But the Viet Minh had seen that with the Chinese help that was now available they could attain a decisive superiority of field guns, men and above all anti-aircraft at Dien Bien Phu. Any sacrifice was worth a conventional victory over the French before Geneva. Ho Chi Minh accepted the battle he was offered.

The French eventually realized that they were in for a tough fight. Before the battle began, the French Defence Minister, perturbed at over-optimism in the United States which "seemed to count on the possibility of a fairly rapid military solution", sent his Chief of Staff, General Ely, to Washington. During Ely's visit the power and invulnerability of the Viet Minh artillery at Dien Bien Phu, and the intensity of the anti-aircraft fire—made possible by Chinese material

## OUT OF THIS WORLD

IRVING LOUIS HOROWITZ: *Three Worlds of Development.* 475pp. Oxford University Press. £3.

This is a barbaresque book—barbarous, that is, in the sense ethnocentric to civilized, polished, refined, urbane. To say as much is in no way to disparage the competence, diligence and intelligence of the author; he obviously has these qualities in abundance. But his book signally lacks elegance of thought and expression. This inevitably detracts seriously from its merit, for the casually is ineffectiveness. If it was only a question of the prose style this might not be a fatal flaw, for there are masterpieces whose insights have laboriously to be reconstructed from tortured prose. But here it is not simply a matter of the language and syntax, for at times the narrative itself gives the impression of having been compiled on Burroughs-like principles by shuffling the filing cards (of which, it may be said, Professor Horowitz clearly possesses a considerable collection).

The book's sub-title is "The Theory and Practice of International Stratification". Its purpose, according to the jacket notes, is to consider development. In "all (sic) its aspects—social, political, economic, military, and psychological". There are four parts. The first is an introduction to the Third World, including a discussion of the concept of "development". The second considers the Old World—the "First World" (the United States) and the "Second World" (the Soviet Union)—and Third World perceptions of, and reactions to them. The following section returns to the Third World in order to explore in depth a number of its characteristics (such as the "dominance of the military in social and political life"). Finally, the fourth part, entitled "Toward a General Theory of Development and Revolution", advances a number of general propositions related to social structure and political change, after having subjected the works of several rival theories of development to critical examination.

Professor Horowitz considers his position to be a radical one. He feels that his book "... will have a greater appeal to those who live and work in poor countries than to those who thrive off the limited affluence found in the wealthy countries". It is true that in 450 pages of text the reader will come across a number of statements and arguments that an American readership would find left-wing, perhaps even daring. For example he says that "... the national liberation front has been the major stimulus to successful popular reform and revolutionary movements in the Third World nations". But this isn't quite what it seems, for it appears on further reading that Professor Horowitz considers India, for instance, an example of a country which has had a successful liberation struggle and a "fully-developed" revolution from below. That is an extraordinary judgment, and betrays the flimsiness of the "theoretical leftism" of the author. It is hard to envisage Professor Horowitz replacing Frantz Fanon as the prophet of the Third World.

Professor Horowitz's analysis and conclusions invite a number of major disagreements. The author talks about the Third World as a "Third Force" and a "Third Position". This view, whatever the evidence that once may have appeared to justify it, is no longer tenable. As Conor Cruise O'Brien has said: "Instead of thinking of a non-aligned Third World, it would be more useful to think in terms of a world-wide capitalist economy of which the supposedly non-aligned countries form an integral part, and considered as a whole, a profitable part. Objectively, their non-alignment represents an enlightened tolerance, by the controllers of the capitalist economy, of unlimited verbal rights in independence and socialism. Where, as occasionally happens, the fight is something more than verbal, varying degrees of indulgence may be shown in practice, but any serious departure from true non-alignment, as

tion than do most of its predecessors. But in any case military effectiveness was not the point at issue. Eden's agreement—that if American power were used, particularly to contain the catch-as-catch-can impressionism and pigmy perception that so often pass for brilliance among us. It is a fact that craft which is so frequently sullied lies in its own transcendence. On first impression it is a self-evident quality. This aim is not to be compromised by a false situation, however painful.

Furthermore the Korean fighting was not yet a year away. In contrast with the situation today, China's non-nuclear power, with its Russian backing ran into a dead end. American atomic attack in 1950 was unlikely to intervene with great troops; and if she did, American ground troops would certainly have been necessary even if their commitment had been avoided in the aftermath of unsuccessful air strikes at Dien Bien Phu. Eisenhower hardly to be blamed for his reluctance in this respect. France had used her own conscripts in Indo-China. She had sent, and lost, a great many of her young leaders. Hence, Professor Fall's statistics showed that the 15,105 officers and men captured at Dien Bien Phu, only 1,200, less than a fifth, were metropolitan Frenchmen. There were nearly 100 Foreign Legionaries, but the remainder were colonial troops. With honour therefore to those who suffered at Dien Bien Phu—indeed, the one-fifth who were French—with every understanding for the hitherto, the United States might well have asked why she should have to send her own conscripts to fight in Indo-China when France's self was fighting so largely by proxy.

The real question is that whether American air power could have saved Dien Bien Phu. Whether Dien Bien Phu was the political risks which heavy bombing would have entailed. It depends the validity of some of the author's criticisms of American military policy, but he does not will it. It may be that nobody can until the political and military account of the battle gives its stronger arguments for air interven-

tion than do most of its predecessors. But in any case military effectiveness was not the point at issue. Eden's agreement—that if American power were used, particularly to contain the catch-as-catch-can impressionism and pigmy perception that so often pass for brilliance among us. It is a fact that craft which is so frequently sullied lies in its own transcendence. On first impression it is a self-evident quality. This aim is not to be compromised by a false situation, however painful.

Furthermore the Korean fighting was not yet a year away. In contrast with the situation today, China's non-nuclear power, with its Russian backing ran into a dead end. American atomic attack in 1950 was unlikely to intervene with great troops; and if she did, American ground troops would certainly have been necessary even if their commitment had been avoided in the aftermath of unsuccessful air strikes at Dien Bien Phu. Eisenhower hardly to be blamed for his reluctance in this respect. France had used her own conscripts in Indo-China. She had sent, and lost, a great many of her young leaders. Hence, Professor Fall's statistics showed that the 15,105 officers and men captured at Dien Bien Phu, only 1,200, less than a fifth, were metropolitan Frenchmen. There were nearly 100 Foreign Legionaries, but the remainder were colonial troops. With honour therefore to those who suffered at Dien Bien Phu—indeed, the one-fifth who were French—with every understanding for the hitherto, the United States might well have asked why she should have to send her own conscripts to fight in Indo-China when France's self was fighting so largely by proxy.

The real question is that whether American air power could have saved Dien Bien Phu. Whether Dien Bien Phu was the political risks which heavy bombing would have entailed. It depends the validity of some of the author's criticisms of American military policy, but he does not will it. It may be that nobody can until the political and military account of the battle gives its stronger arguments for air interven-

tion than do most of its predecessors. But in any case military effectiveness was not the point at issue. Eden's agreement—that if American power were used, particularly to contain the catch-as-catch-can impressionism and pigmy perception that so often pass for brilliance among us. It is a fact that craft which is so frequently sullied lies in its own transcendence. On first impression it is a self-evident quality. This aim is not to be compromised by a false situation, however painful.

Furthermore the Korean fighting was not yet a year away. In contrast with the situation today, China's non-nuclear power, with its Russian backing ran into a dead end. American atomic attack in 1950 was unlikely to intervene with great troops; and if she did, American ground troops would certainly have been necessary even if their commitment had been avoided in the aftermath of unsuccessful air strikes at Dien Bien Phu. Eisenhower hardly to be blamed for his reluctance in this respect. France had used her own conscripts in Indo-China. She had sent, and lost, a great many of her young leaders. Hence, Professor Fall's statistics showed that the 15,105 officers and men captured at Dien Bien Phu, only 1,200, less than a fifth, were metropolitan Frenchmen. There were nearly 100 Foreign Legionaries, but the remainder were colonial troops. With honour therefore to those who suffered at Dien Bien Phu—indeed, the one-fifth who were French—with every understanding for the hitherto, the United States might well have asked why she should have to send her own conscripts to fight in Indo-China when France's self was fighting so largely by proxy.

## SPECULATION IS NOT HISTORY

ALBERT SOBOUT: *Paysans, sans-culottes et Jacobins. Etudes d'histoire révolutionnaire.* 386pp. Paris: Librairie Cluvieul.

Professor Sobout's scholarship, in its French rigour and assiduity, splendidly attests in its long apprenticeship and craftsman's finish, answers the catch-as-catch-can impressionism and pigmy perception that so often pass for brilliance among us. It is a fact that craft which is so frequently sullied lies in its own transcendence. On first impression it is a self-evident quality. This aim is not to be compromised by a false situation, however painful.

Furthermore the Korean fighting was not yet a year away. In contrast with the situation today, China's non-nuclear power, with its Russian backing ran into a dead end. American atomic attack in 1950 was unlikely to intervene with great troops; and if she did, American ground troops would certainly have been necessary even if their commitment had been avoided in the aftermath of unsuccessful air strikes at Dien Bien Phu. Eisenhower hardly to be blamed for his reluctance in this respect. France had used her own conscripts in Indo-China. She had sent, and lost, a great many of her young leaders. Hence, Professor Fall's statistics showed that the 15,105 officers and men captured at Dien Bien Phu, only 1,200, less than a fifth, were metropolitan Frenchmen. There were nearly 100 Foreign Legionaries, but the remainder were colonial troops. With honour therefore to those who suffered at Dien Bien Phu—indeed, the one-fifth who were French—with every understanding for the hitherto, the United States might well have asked why she should have to send her own conscripts to fight in Indo-China when France's self was fighting so largely by proxy.

The real question is that whether American air power could have saved Dien Bien Phu. Whether Dien Bien Phu was the political risks which heavy bombing would have entailed. It depends the validity of some of the author's criticisms of American military policy, but he does not will it. It may be that nobody can until the political and military account of the battle gives its stronger arguments for air interven-

at his parts. Ultimately, and perhaps paradoxically, his history takes on the qualities and limitations of an original document. The effect can be quite remarkable, particularly for a reader bred in Anglo-Saxon traditions if such words can be applied to the haphazard exposure we call training. Like a needle shower, it is at once stimulating and irritating. Take one of the dozen seminal articles Professor Sobout reprints in this collection—"Classes populaires et Rousseauisme". This is a penetrating examination of the so-called Rousseauism of the *sans-culottes*. The existence of the "Rousseauism" is proven, its sources and "channels" sought. Everything which can be documented is scrutinized—the evidence of Merdier and other writers, of arrest papers, journals, pamphlets; *colportages*, boxes, are rummaged. The article is a gem. But there is a resolute refusal to go beyond the straitly documented. Even English and American artisans given the right circumstances—the English dearth of 1795, the Philadelphia inflation crisis of 1780—could talk "pure Rousseau". Rousseau's family background—so similar to, say, Duplay's, the "cabinet-maker" of property with whom Robespierre lodged, or for that matter, to Ben Loxley's, Franklin's Philadelphia technician who called himself a *sans-culotte*, or that of scores of English artisans Jacobins—is curiously described, but there is no serious attempt to seek the meaning of this peculiar resonance of Rousseau among artisans. In truth, the *sans-culottes* reception of Rousseau seems very similar to British artisans' reception of Paine—it was a shock of recognition. The kind of country opened up by speculation of this type is shunned.

Speculation is not history: witness the author's lively piece on popular religious cults during the Revolution. Once again, what can be documented, what can be anchored, pinned down, is treated with consummate mastery. But in this field above all, surely, it is impossible to avoid speculation. Curiously

enough, for the student of the author of *La Grande peur* and for the historian who established the *antiquity* of the *sans-culotte* movement, there seems to be a certain reluctance to accord popular irrationality its full validity as evidence. Professor Sobout seems more at home with the objectively concrete (to coin a phrase). One is left, even in his most masterful exercises, with the sense of a missing dimension. If only he could sometimes lose his temper and not relegate Pierre Dueroguet, the simple, impressive man of Section Marat so sickeningly executed as a *libérte*, to his footnotes; if only he could, on occasion, throw his *bonnet rouge* over the hedge. No one knows more and understands the more of *sans-culottes* than he does: would that he were sometimes more subjective and less scientific.

The biggest paradox of all is that this refusal to speculate operates within the terms of what is, after all, the most massive speculation of them all—the assumptions of Marxism, and a rather orthodox Marxism at that. Many of the articles in this collection are devoted to an examination of the "contradictions" in the *sans-culottes* Jacobin alliance and within *sans-culottes* itself. The author's major conclusions, of course, are argued decisively. But one jibs at a certain rigidity. The line between *sans-culottes* and Jacobins sometimes seems too tightly drawn, even as criteria shift. Chaler in Lyons in the early summer of 1793 was preaching a programme which in Paris is called *enragé*. Norman Hampson has noted a kind of "fusio" in many provincial cities in the civil war atmosphere of that year; there is similar evidence from the post-Terror period, after the Robespierist inebrius had been removed; so many of the "contradictions" seem to be common to so many groups, even, as Professor Sobout points out, to the *enragés* Jacobins. Once again, what can be documented, what can be anchored, pinned down, is treated with consummate mastery. But in this field above all, surely, it is impossible to avoid speculation. Curiously

enough, for the student of the author of *La Grande peur* and for the historian who established the *antiquity* of the *sans-culotte* movement, there seems to be a certain reluctance to accord popular irrationality its full validity as evidence. Professor Sobout seems more at home with the objectively concrete (to coin a phrase). One is left, even in his most masterful exercises, with the sense of a missing dimension. If only he could sometimes lose his temper and not relegate Pierre Dueroguet, the simple, impressive man of Section Marat so sickeningly executed as a *libérte*, to his footnotes; if only he could, on occasion, throw his *bonnet rouge* over the hedge. No one knows more and understands the more of *sans-culottes* than he does: would that he were sometimes more subjective and less scientific.

All this, however, is simply to say that, like all first-class history, Professor Sobout's opens as many doors as it closes. This collection of his important articles is a splendid sample of his work and ought to be translated as soon as possible.

Nearly half the book is devoted to those rural studies which were the author's first and abiding interest; incisive as they are, they will probably engage attention less than those on topics related to Professor Sobout's great book on the Parisian *sans-culottes*, the studies of popular militants and Jacobins, of problems of labour in Year II of the Republic, of the wage-maximum and Thermidor, of Robespierre and the popular societies (thou Maximilien is cruel, as Babeuf called him, can be anything but a villain to any true *sans-culotte* passes one's understanding). This concentration of interest, unfair though it be, is in the last resort just. For Professor Sobout has rediscovered a whole world which had been lost. He has added a whole dimension of the historiography of the Revolution. He not only sustains and enhances a great tradition of history; he has also helped to redirect the course of historical study itself. British historians should take possession of his work, even if it leads some of us wryly to wonder whether we need another 1066.

Gallimard, Paris, have published *Le Gai savoir: fragments posthumes (1881-1882)* (607pp. 35fr.) in their series "Friedrich Nietzsche. Oeuvres philosophiques complètes". It consists of fragments which have been assembled and put into chronological order by Giorgio Colli and Massimo Montinari from the Nietzsche papers in the Goethe and Schiller Archiv at Weimar. This edition of *Die Frühe Wissenschaft*, first published by Walter de Gruyter, Berlin, has been translated by Pierre Klossowski, under the general editorship of Gilles Deleuze and Michel Foucault. Some of the fragments were originally published in mutilated form by Nietzsche's wife Elizabeth and by Peter Gast; some, however, have never appeared before. This volume is to be followed by several others of unpublished material, leading to Nietzsche's breakdown in 1889.

## University Presses of Chicago Columbia &amp; Yale

70 Russell St London WC1

## Tibet: A Political History

BY TSONG W. D. NIAKHAPA  
WITH A FOREWORD BY TINJOLINESS THE DALAI LAMA  
The first history of Tibet by a Tibetan to be published in English. W. D. Shukabpa, now living in exile, was Minister of Finance of Tibet. Illustrated.  
Yale 360 pages 75s net  
To be published August 15th

## The Emergence of Pakistan

BY CHAUDHURI MUHAMMAD ALI  
The former Prime Minister of Pakistan gives the first authoritative account of the last days of the British Empire in India and the tremendous upheavals that attended partition. Maps.  
Columbia 418 pages 78s net  
To be published August 14th

## The Indus Rivers

A Study of the Effects of Partition  
BY ALOYS A. MICHEL  
"An enduring classic of scholarship and of insight. I know of no comparable exposition of the dynamic relation between rivers and men, their institutions and their politics."—DAVID E. LUBATKIN.  
Yale 595 pages 60s net  
To be published August 15th

## The Idea of the Humanities

And other Essays Critical and Historical  
BY R. S. CRANE  
These two volumes bring together a selection of Crane's hitherto unpublished writings and a variety of published papers formerly available only in scattered sources.  
Chicago 311 and 332 pages 105s net

## Columbia Essays on Modern Writers

Four new titles:  
JOHN WAIN on Arnold Bennett; J. P. KERN on T. S. Eliot; GEORGE STACE on Robert Graves; J. J. MATTHEWS on André Breton.  
Columbia 48 pages 55 each

## Glossary of Linguistic Terminology

BY MARCO PUI  
An up-to-date survey of the terminology of linguistics, including the standard terminology in the areas of descriptive, historical and geolinguistics with examples where practicable.  
Columbia 299 pages 48s net

## The City

BY DOBERT E. PARK AND ERNEST W. BURGESS  
The Heritage of Sociology Series  
Here reprinted in its entirety, *The City* (1925) is a cross section of the concerns of the Chicago urban school during the period of its most intense activity.  
Chicago 239 pages 37s 6d net

## Merleau-Ponty

Existentialist of the 'Social World'  
BY AENRT RABIL, JR.  
Traces the evolution of Merleau-Ponty's thought in the context of the political and intellectual life of post-war France.  
Columbia 331 pages 56s net

## The Emergent American Society

Volume I  
LARGE SCALE ORGANIZATIONS  
BY W. ELOY WARNER, S. R. UNWALLA AND J. H. THOMAS  
Analyses the development of each major social element from its early fragmentation to the enormous hierarchical organizations which characterize America today.  
Yale 667 pages 105s net

## The Shape of Catholic Higher Education

EDITED BY ROBERT HASSENGER WITH A FOREWORD BY DAVID MESSIAN  
A group of young Catholic intellectuals provide a thorough investigation into all aspects of Catholic higher education in America today.  
Chicago 378 pages 67s net

## A Social and Religious History of the Jews

Second Edition  
Revised and Enlarged  
BY SAUL WITTMAYER BARON  
Late Middle Ages and Era of European Expansion, 1200-1650  
Volume XI: Citizen or Alien Conjuror  
Volume XII: Economic Catalyst  
Columbia 725 each volume

## A Critical Approach to Children's Literature

EDITED BY SARA L. FENWICK  
Papers from the 31st Annual Conference of the Graduate Library School, the University of Chicago, include studies of: Children's Reading and Adult Values; Machine Animism in Modern Children's Literature; and The Critic and Children's Literature.  
Chicago 129 pages 33s 6d net



## ALL FOR AFRICA

CLAUDE WAUTHIEN: *The Literature and Thought of Modern Africa*. 323pp. Pall Mall Press. £2 5s. (Paperback, 16s.)

he aims. The dynamic and conservative forces that coexist within *utegrindne*, and are both equally germane to its purposes, are clearly expressed in his summary. Every major view on the nature of racism can be found here, as can the classic debate between the dialectical view of

The trouble about this very eclecticism, which looks at all works of literature as evidence, alongside ethnological, historical and political theses, is that everything becomes of equal value. Each work must be

plotted on the ideological map, but every flag is of precisely the same size. The effect is to obscure the one distinction which really matters where

literature is concerned, the distinction between good work and bad. Hence M. Wauthier's book will be of assistance to the intellectual historian or the scholar looking for titles with which to substantiate this viewpoint or that, but it provides no guidance whatever for the critical process of reading, experiencing and deciding. His lament that the literature has too often been looked at "purely from the point of view of literary criticism" can be stood on its head.

## IRELAND

Hyda described the heroic age of Cuchulainn and Queen Maeve, the hunting exploits of Fionn and the Fianna, the gradual intermingling of pagan myth and Christian belief in the semi-historical tales. During the long centuries of invasion and occupation, Gaelic civilization slowly declined, but in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries there were new developments both in poetry and prose.

In recent years, research has been intensified and much new material has been edited, including the sophisticated courtly love lyrics which were introduced after the Norman conquest. Despite all this activity, *A Literary History of Ireland* still pre-

serves its interest. A *Text Book of Irish Literature*, by Ellnor Hull, and *Gaelic Literature Surveyed* by Aodh de Blacem are more limited in their range. Each has its merits, yet neither has superseded the pioneer work of Dr. Hyde, now made available once more, with prefatory note by Mr. Brinn O'Cur.

tion of the centenary  
2nd August, 1867.

**Works**  
**Wson**  
**SMOND FLOWER**  
ed poets in England in the last years  
Hardy Bridges, Swinburne, Housman

## LIVE OR DAI

**LIVE OR DIE**  
Translated by Anthony Conran

no one who has tried to render verse  
in similar conditions will under-  
estimate what such help means.

To look then first at what Mr.  
Conran has made of the best-known  
things:—Aeneid, admirable;  
Llywarch, disappointing in respect of  
the Old Man's Lament, but excellent  
in respect of the hall of Cynddylan;  
Hýwel ab Owain, Gwynedd, Owain  
Cyfellog, and Cynddelw Brydydd  
Mawr, all three excellent; and the  
controlled but terrifying lament for  
Llywelyn the Last, Prince of Gwel-  
ludd ob yr Ynad Cochr, magnificent.

The heart's gone cold, under a breath  
of fear:  
Lust shrivels like dried brushwood,  
See you not the way of the wind and the  
rain?  
See you not the oakleaves buffeted  
together?

## Christ Stopped at Ebola

Do you not believe God: demented mortals?

Do you not see the whole world's danger?

Why, O my God, does the sea not cover the land?

Why are we left to linger?

There is no refuge from imprisonment

And nowhere to bide—O such abiding I see no counsel, neither look out opening.

No way to escape fear's sad counsel.

Of modern poets he does best with R. Williams, Percy, Saunders Lewis, Gwynell, and Wladys Williams: he does not make them sound as they sound in Welsh, but he does make them appear the fine poets they are in that language.

For many readers of Welsh poetry in translation (to say nothing of readers of Welsh poetry in Welsh):

The first question must be, what has he made of the *cywydd* and *englyn*? These are such distinct Welsh genres that until Professor Glanville came

along in 1965 no one had got all that near to solving the technical problems of the *cywydd* in translation, while

serves its interest. *A Text Book of Irish Literature*, by Elinor Hull, and *Gaelic Literature Surveyed* by Aodh de Blacam are more limited in their range. Each has its merits, yet neither has superseded the pioneer work of Dr. Hyde, now made available once more, with prefatory note by Mr. Brinn O' Cuis.

on of the centenary  
n 2nd August, 1867.

# Works

## son

### SMOND FLOWER

ed poets in England in the last years  
Hardy, Bridges, Swinburne, Housman

... spirit of the *fin de siècle* is more truly  
de la," said Sir Ifor Evans, "the poet  
ies; he is in verse what Beardsley was  
d of Ebbell

book which received an ovation from  
published in 1948. C. V. Wedgwood,  
called it "a noble and impressive  
*New Statesman* found it "one of the  
ave read for many years." *The Times*

It was "one of the finest books which the war" 257

**of Warwick**

... be written. A real contribution to

...being extremely readable. Miss [Name] from the first page to the last. *Society*.  
...very well written." *The Economist*.  
...life is chronicled in this vivacious [Name] documentation." JAMES DRAWELL,

the 1990s, the number of people in the United States who are 65 years of age or older is projected to increase from 20 million to 35 million, and the number of people 75 years of age or older is projected to increase from 10 million to 17 million (U.S. Census Bureau, 1996).

# The Poetical Works of Ernest Dowson

Edited and introduced by DESMOND FLOWER

There were many distinguished poets in England in the last years of the nineteenth century. Hardy, Bridges, Swinburne, Housman, Alice Meynell and Francis Thompson—but these were not poets of any particular era. The real spirit of the *fin de siècle* is more truly found in Ernest Dowson. "He is," said Sir Ifor Evans, "the poet symbolic of the eighteen nineties; he is in verse what Beardsley was in pictorial art." 30/-

## Christ Stopped at Ebola

CARLO LEVI

A re-issue of a memorable book which received an ovation from the Press when it was first published in 1943. C. V. Wedgwood, reviewing it in *Time and Tide*, called it "a noble and impressive book." V. S. Pritchett in the *New Statesman* found it "one of the most absorbing books that I have read for many years." The *Times Literary Supplement* said that it was "one of the finest books which has appeared in Europe since the war." 254

## The Countess of Warwick

"This is biography as it should be written. A real contribution to English social history as well as being extremely readable. Miss Blunden's approach is objective from the first page to the last." SIR CHARLES PETRIE, *The Book Society*.

"Both entertaining and extremely well written." *The Economist*.

"Lady Warwick's tempestuous life is chronicled in this vivacious book with loving care and expert documentation." JAMES DRAWBULT, *Edinburgh Evening News*. 50s.

**CASSELL**

Welfare











## CYRUS EXCISED

JAMES D. SMART: *History and Theology in Second Isaiah*. 304pp. Epworth Press, 35s

One cannot help regretting that so much valuable homiletic material should be bordered by a critical position which is hardly likely to find any more general acceptance than Torrey's did in its generation. Nevertheless, Professor Smart has written a very striking book, which deserves the most respectful consideration. While the paucity of footnotes is commendable, the absence of any indexes is to be regretted.

## EASTERN A

**MARIO RINVOLUCRI:** *Anatomy of a*  
mond. 192pp. Burns and C

By reason of their unique blend of the self-confidence of Rome with a freedom of discipline approaching that of the Anglican tradition, the Eastern Churches have always promised to play a mediating part in the movement towards unity in the west. This role, stemming possibly from the east's geographical immunity from the upheavals of sixteenth-century Europe, has been further strengthened by the leading part played by Orthodoxy in the World Council of Churches from its very beginning and, more recently, in peace moves with Rome, initiated by Pope John and followed up by his successor.

MARIO RINVOLUCRI: *Anatomy of a Church*. Foreword by Peter Hammond. 192pp. Burns and Oates. 15s.

Apart from giving the outsider a good view of the workaday life of the Church (Mr. Rinvouluri lived for three years in Greece), he also reflects of the Church's ecumenical contacts in considerable detail. He has no illusions about the task facing the Greek Church if it is to emerge from the hyper-nationalism handed down from the revolution of 1821. Some of the younger theologians, he says, are beginning to edge their Church towards a broader view, but adds: "They will have a hard job of it."

# RYTHING

dition. Tom Palne to Lloyd C...

## TINNING TURTLE

It is three years now since Mr. Timothy were brought out his classic paperback history of the Orthodox Church; Mr. Rinvulieri has produced an excellent complementary study of the state of the Oreek Orthodox Church today. It is a tremendously thorough work in which he sets out at the village pump, so to speak, and examines in over wide

**DENYS HAY** : *Europe in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries*. 420pp. Longmans. 35s.

tioned in the originating era. Radicalism, is dismissed with an attempt to explain its various generations.

Owen, the chief exponent of socialism and the millennial of the nineteenth century, is represented as the spirit of tailoring improvement at its most complete, a wording him a consolation to his part-founder at Westminster, the author overlooks the point but lost cases which are inspired, and in particular the of utilitarian and class conflict promoted among his disciples by economic doctrines. In spite of a chapter on Chartism, the greater world of militant workingmen and Radicalism is left unexplored.

The tradition of Radicalism is traced with success through the careers of Cobden, Bright, and John Ruskin, Mill and Joseph Chamberlain, correcting the myth that there was a gimmereck theory and of dreadful jargon who was his principle of utility, and represents him as sensible and moderate. Mill, normally credited with mitigated and humanized utilitarianism, is here condemned as "authoritarian streak" and "battering after a dictatorship of the Intellectuals". This view, familiar as the main theme of the study of Mill, is

"They burst from every possible nook and cranny with wildly flapping carapaces producing audible bat-like squeaks in their panic-stricken movements to get away."

But crayfishing was not practicable without a great deal of capital and so Mr. Travis got on with the turtle-catching. The factory was soon in operation and in order to ensure supplies he travelled widely along the inhospitable coast establishing subsidiary camps where the turtle was plentiful. In this way he came into intimate contact with the fishermen, town officials and the coastal nomads. He draws a sympathetic picture of the nomadic peoples and their sufferings in times of drought when they are forced to travel at least thirty miles a day to find pastures and water for their cattle. Children under two vents of age are a threat to survival under such terrible conditions and under stress they are abandoned. Mr. Travis himself rescued two of these unfortunate but was requested by town officials to refrain from bringing in any more. Mr. Travis writes well about the problems facing this backward country. Although the turtle canning prospered, pressures from foreign political influences forced him to leave Somalia.

MORNA D. HOOKER : *The Son of Man in Mark*. 230pp. S.P.C.K. 38s. 6d.

Morna D. Hooker, in this latest contribution to the debate on the title, Son of man in the Gospels, has reacted conservatively to much recent writing on the subject. While some scholars go so far as to deny the authenticity of all the Son of man sayings, there is a growing area of agreement that, although using this term, Jesus referred not to himself, but to an eschatological figure or concept. Dr. Hooker selects for special attention the work of A. J. B. Higgins in this country and of R. H. Fuller in America: Because they and other exponents of the form-critical and traditio-critical methods, despite a basic common ground, differ from one another in important details, she does not think that these methods are likely to produce an agreed solution to the problem. As an alternative

"to authority which is in turn proclaimed, denied and vindicated". It is the same theme as in Daniel vii. As Son of man Jesus claims authority, as Son of man his obedience brings him to suffering, as Son of man he will be vindicated.

Dr. Hooker suggests that, although not all the sayings are necessarily authentic, the "coherent interpretation" of the Son of man she discerns in Mark may be pre-Markan, and even traceable to Jesus himself. Against this, it is significant that, as she admits, to the other gospels all she can discover is "traces of the supposed Markan tradition, the pattern is pre-Markan and belongs to the original tradition from Jesus, it is strange that only Mark preserves it. We should expect more than mere vestiges of it elsewhere. But in fact, those "traces" are more probably

DOM SEBASTIAN MOORE: *God is a New Language*. 184pp. Darton, Longman and Todd. 12s. 6d.

Dom Sebastian Moore is a Benedictine monk from Downside who now attempts to show where the gaps are and how they can be filled—not through

Mill had as positive a state action as Chamberlain's "socialism," but the difference is that the former's criticism merely reflects the ideas of Mill and his disciples, while the latter's is a criticism of Mill's *Dissertations on Liberty and Chapters on Socialism*. Both state action had to be an assertion of the public class and not the class demanded by the Labour movement or the proposed reformist politicians. In dealing with the practical policies of the Labour Government, Lloyd George the conservative had to deal with the

## HOW NOW BROWN TROUT?

E. Frost and M. E. Brown: *The Trout*. 286pp. 46 plates.  
Collins. 25s.

all of these, as is demonstrated, growth patterns vary much with local conditions including food, and the authors have dealt comprehensively with the latter subject.

Both the physical and biological environments in Britain have been treated at some length and there are also excellent sections on anatomy and physiology, taxonomy and heredity. Nor have the authors forgotten to discuss conservation, pollution and the inevitable impact of the human population explosion on the aquatic habitat in a final chapter entitled "Trout and Man".

More technical appendices are included for the biologist interested in fish biology and assessment of stocks as well as a good bibliographic list. Both text and illustrations maintain the high standard for accuracy and quality that is expected from a volume in the New Naturalist series.

impact which the "Son of man" sayings make when we look at oae Gospel—St. Mark's", to discover whether the Markan sayings form a consistent pattern end, if so, whether it in any way illuminates Jesus's use of the term.

As a preparation for this task Dr. Hooker devotes Part I of her book, comprising nearly a third of the whole, to the Jewish background. She suggests that in Daniel vii the theme is that of the rejection by the nations of the authority of the righteous in Israel, their sufferings, and their ultimate vindication. This theme appears also in the inter-testamental literature, especially in the Similitudes of Enoch, where the corporate Danielic figure becomes an individual Son of man with corporate characteristics.

In the second part the sayings are studied, not according to their classification as referring to the present, the passion, and the future, but on their Markan order, so that they may fall into their own pattern. According to Dr. Hooker, this pattern runs across the familiar three classes of sayings, because these groups together present three aspects of the authority of Jesus as the Son of man,

Dom Sebastian Moore is a Benedictine monk from Downside who nowadays works in a Liverpool parlour. He brings to pastoral problems the insight of a scholar and the sense of urgency of the man on the job. His book, as he himself admits, is unsystematic, consisting largely of reprinted articles, and sermons. But perhaps this is an advantage, for his concern is not to present a schematized defence of theological language, but rather to look at the confusion that has come about in a time of unparalleled religious change—a confusion that has to be looked at and listened to in fragments here and there before the constructive work of reassembly can begin.

There is much that is unusual in the inherited habits of theological thinking and talking; often there is little sense of the idea becoming the determining reality of a life to be lived. This lively and honest book is an at-

tempt to show where the gaps are and how they can be filled—not through a crude reductionism that empties the idea of God or the truths of religion of their essential meaning but through the acceptance of a Christian revolution, which in turn means a Christian nihilism "that spontaneously gives to such statements, as 'he humbled himself, taking the form of a slave' an, excitingly more, than ethical sense".

The book begins with a chapter called "A Catholic Neurosis?" (the neurosis proceeding from the rigidity of the ideal Catholic structure, "which prevents it from being assimilated, which causes its truth to drown the soul rather than water it") and ends with "In a Word" ("the naked encounter with that final reality that men call God"). It is between these poles that the argument is pursued: it is always vigorous, compassionate and wise.



## ATMOSPHERICS

## SIMPLE PEOPLE

**THE TIMES**  
**TERARY SUPPLEMENT**

**Great Britain.**

CUT OUT THIS COUPON AND HAND IT TO YOUR NEWSAGENT OR POST IT TO THE SUBSCRIPTION MANAGER, THE TIMES, PRINTING HOUSE SQUARE, LONDON, E.C.4.

Please enter a year's subscription (issues) to THE TIMES LITERARY SUPPLEMENT on my behalf.

NAME .....

ADDRESS .....

COUNTRY .....

☐ I enclose .....

☐ Please send me an invoice .....

## SATIRICAL SPANIARDS

## SAINT AND SINNERS

## GREAT DIVIDES

## RECENT

19. HANSEN, University  
 10s. 6d.  
 Philosophy.—MAURICE, MANDELBAUM:  
*Philosophy, Science and Sense* (Penguin  
 edn.). Johns Hopkins Press, 20s. DAVIO  
 MITCHELL: *An Introduction to Logic*.  
 Hutchinson University Library, 10s 6d.  
 Politics and Political Theory.—ANDREW  
 W. GOMMON: *Politics*. 10s. 6d.  
 (Editors): *The Quest for Peace*. The  
 Dag Hammarskjöld Memorial Lectures.  
 Columbia University Press, 21s.  
 ENGELS: *Selected Writings*. Edited  
 and introduced by W. O. Henderson.  
 Pelican, 7s. 6d. HAROLO  
 F. GOMMON: *Negro Politics*.  
 Introduction by James C.  
 Wilson. Phoenix Books, 21s.  
 ROGER HILSMAN and ROBERT  
 C. GOOD (Editors): *Foreign Policy*  
*in the Sixties: The Issues and*  
*the Instruments*. Essays in Honor of  
 Irving Wallerstein. Johns Hopkins  
 Press, 20s. FRED CLARE: *How*  
*Nations Negotiate*. Praeger Paperbacks.  
 18s. MILTON R. KONVITZ: *A Century*  
*of Civil Rights*. With a Study of  
 State Law Against Discrimination by

## BOOKS RECEIVED

There is a lot of reading in *Animal Twilight*, which is about the conservation of wildlife in the world today. Man has always threatened the wild creatures of the earth to the point of



## Letters to the Editor (continued)

## MORE COPYRIGHT

Sir—A number—probably even a majority—of your correspondents, on the subject of copyright, cherish original convictions about the nature of copyright and are unaware of the difference between copyright and market rights.

The object of copyright law is to give the standard legal authority, *Copyright* & *Market Rights* is to protect the writer and artist from the unauthorised reproduction of his material. The errors of your correspondents stem from a belief that authors are wrong to assume that the copyright in books they have written is of all things—their. It seems that it really belongs—or ought to belong—to readers. An American author who is so bold as to arrange with an American publisher to supply the United States market with his book while reserving the British market rights for publication with a British publisher (a thing which may take time to achieve or may not be achieved at all) is behaving, according to several of your correspondents, in a way which the government of the world, when reviving their respective laws of copyright, should stop. But neither national laws of copyright nor international copyright conventions enforce market rights. The American publisher, if he is above his license, in selling his edition only in the American market, if he sold copies outside that market he would be in breach of his agreement with the author, and liable to be sued on that ground.

Readers, however, are not in contractual relations with the authors they wish to read and are free to get a friend in the United States to buy and mail to them a copy of an American edition or to get one of the specialist export booksellers there to do it for them. This is a reasonable thing to do when a British publisher publishes a British edition which are served the trouble. But this cannot happen with every title. There are too many. The common cry is that British publishers bring out too many new books (about 28,000 last year) but at American publishers bring out just as many—to say nothing of French, German, Italian, Spanish, Dutch, Swedish, Norwegian, Danish and other foreign publishers who wish to have as many as possible of their books translated into English—it would seem that British publishers may reasonably be permitted to exercise some choice in the books upon which they decide to invest their money. And the despised British publishers can at least claim that they publish far more American books than American publishers issue of the products of British authorship.

As one of your correspondents, Mr.

Sir—In your issue of July 6, you described the letter from the Secretary of the Publishers Association as "important". To at least one of us who is publishing in a developing country it is appalling—to a degree which causes embarrassment.

The leading article in your issue of June 29 dealt very fully with the copyright problem, and in particular drew attention to that part of the Protocol regarding wholesale reproduction for educational purposes. This point does have serious implications, but to a critical eye Mr. Barker himself appears to be continuing the emotional atmosphere of which he complains in Spockholm, and in his present letter he is tending to overstate his case and thus to weaken it.

His argument runs thus: if the Protocol is added to the Copyright Convention these developing countries are heading for disaster—depriving themselves of the inspiration of their native writers, and preventing the growth of a national publishing industry. Worse, no longer will they have any British publishers to produce, annually, 400 million worth of schoolbooks developed for their special needs by outside experts, or to train their local writers and publishers or to publish the works of their "literary figures of world stature".

The first part of this argument may or may not come true.

However, it is the second part which I find the most disconcerting, mainly because it assumes that these developing countries will get nowhere unless British publishers are allowed to continue in their present dominant position. In South-east Asia alone there are several developing countries which do not depend upon foreign publishers or authors for expertise. In Thailand, the Philippines and Indonesia there are no expatriate publishers producing books locally, and in Malaysia and Singapore most of the books used in schools are written by local authors (the few exceptions are mainly English Language courses, 60 per cent of which are published by local firms). The local firms (and their authors) have not, so far as I know, been helped by their British competitors but despite this, including Deewan, Balasubramanian and P. S. S. Publishers, are so sophisticated in their publishing that they have set the pace. It is true that a few foreign firms have done a certain amount of academic and general publishing of works by local writers but the University of Malaya Press, another local firm, has been very active.

But I suspect that when Mr. Barker writes of developing countries he is in fact referring to African countries (and if this is the case, why is he not more specific?). Some British publishers have been established in Africa for thirty years or more. Besides selling textbooks they have, according to Mr. Barker, been writing local authors and publicists. Why then are East and West Africa still so dependent upon books produced by outsiders? Has it never occurred to Mr. Barker that it is not only the Protocol attached to the Convention which could hamper the growth of indigenous publishing and writing? The continuing domination of foreign publishers and writers could also have the same effect. "The developed world may well owe the developing world a living." This is true. But what Mr. Barker is also saying is that the developing world owes the developed world a living—to the extent of £10m. per annum—and that is nonsense.

If British publishers lose these former colonial markets in the developing countries, it will be only partly because of the Protocol. It will be chiefly because they have not been able to adapt themselves to changing local circumstances: they will have commissioned too few local authors; published too few translations in the local languages; printed too few books locally; and trained too few people to succeed them. There might be no need for the Protocol if all this had been done in the past.

Bob Cobbing (July 20) states that he "knows Americans who are equally frustrated in their desire to obtain British titles. It is worth mentioning while both the British and the American copyright laws precisely permit the importation of copyright books under certain circumstances, among them 'for personal use and not for sale, provided not more than one copy be imported at one time'." American law goes into more specific detail than British on the point. Mr. Cobbing's American friends are not, I suspect, ignorant of their own legal rights.

The most remarkable proposition of all those put forward by your correspondents is that of Mr. Neville March Himmings (July 20). He thinks that "the law of copyright is a factor in the restriction of free speech". The law of copyright is concerned with the control, by the speaker, of the reproduction of his work, not with the right to speak with the freedom of the law. The present restrictions on freedom of speech in Rhodesia, for instance, have not in any way affected, or been affected by, the law of copyright.

May I, in conclusion, put forward an analogy which I hope will be helpful and not seem too frivolous. If I wished to buy a genuine Turkish fez, which for some reason I considered a superior form of hat to the English bowler, I suspect I should experience difficulty in getting one of satisfactory colour and fit. I have no doubt the thing could be done, though probably not without a good deal of troublesome enquiry and correspondence and possibly also the payment of import duty. I should not on that account think myself obliged to a conspirator by British hat-makers to impose a hat "censorship" upon me. I should make the sure obvious assumption that too few men in this country shared my passion for the fez to warrant British hat-makers keeping a range of this headgear in stock. Of course the British hat-makers might be wrong. But hat-makers are businessmen; because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.  
Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Mr. Barker, because they do not think they can sufficiently widespread demand to justify the production of a British fez, it would be ridiculous of me to allege just does, in parallel circumstances, one of your correspondents on copyright) that they were "withholding" the fez from me. They would merely be obliging me to apply to Turkey for the one I want, and they being in the hat trade as I am not, I would be willing to allow that they might be right.

J. ALAN WHITE, Chairman.

## CLASSIFIED ADVERTISEMENTS

RATES 5s. a line (minimum 100s. a line) minimum 2s. Semi-display £3.5s. an inch. Display £4 an inch.

ORDERS and Box Replies to: Classified Advertisement Department, The Times Literary Supplement, Printing House Square, London, E.C.4. Tel: 01-236 2000, ext. 318. Telex 262622.

## APPOINTMENTS VACANT LIBRARIANS

## A CAREER IN COMPUTERS

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## TECHNICAL INFORMATION ASSISTANT

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS

## LIBRARIANS